

Memorandum



To: [Redacted] s 7(2)(f)(ii)

From: [Redacted] s 7(2)(f)(ii)

Subject: MAUAO BASE TRACK REMEDIATION OPTIONS – MULTI CRITERIA ANALYSIS

Date: 26 January 2018

Purpose

To communicate the criteria and rationale used in the development of the multi criteria analysis (MCA) and to provide a written summary of the results of the MCA (Attachment A).

Background

In April 2017 a significant weather event caused a large slope failure that severed the Mauao base track. Tonkin and Taylor (T+T) undertook an options analysis of the possible track remediation options, the report is provided in Attachment B.

Process

A staff workshop was conducted to work through the options provided by Tonkin & Taylor. This was backed up by MCA analysis which has been prepared retrospectively to demonstrate the thought process and decision making criteria discussed at the time.

A further whiteboard session was conducted at the 6 June 2017 meeting of Ngā Poutiriao o Mauao (Mauao Joint Administration Board). This board consists of four elected members and appointed representatives of each iwi that has membership of the Mauao Trust. The board agreed with the option selected.

Council approved the recommendation of Ngā Poutiriao o Mauao (Mauao Joint Administration Board) in **DC 149** dated 28 June 2017 (Attachment C).

M17/55.8 Moved [Redacted] s 7(2)(a) ... Privacy

That it be resolved

That Council:

- (a) Approve option one, to fund up to \$2.2M to remediate slip damage on Mauao in 2017/18 from the Risk Reserve.**

MCA Criteria and Weighting

The MCA criteria and weightings are explained in the table below.

Criteria	Reason for inclusion	Reason for weighting	Weighting
Alignment long term resilience	The Mauao base track has in excess of	This criteria recognises the importance of implementing	40

accounting for future slope failure within the wider area	1,000,000 annual visitor trips	an option that provides a solution that presents a low risk of track failure in the long term and/or is able to be quickly and cost effectively remediated should a section of slope fail in the future.	
Impact on Archaeology	Mauao has a high density of recorded archaeology which is of particular significance regionally and nationally	This criteria recognises the importance of implementing an option that has a low potential impact on archaeology	30
Construction Cost Estimate	The estimated cost of the remediation option	This criteria recognises the estimated cost of each option and the importance of financial prudence	20
Statutory considerations	The anticipated statutory tests of the remediation option	This criteria recognises that the options have differing degrees of statutory considerations	10

Scoring

The criteria were scored 1 to 5 (worst to best) based on their judged compliance with the MCA criteria.

For the construction cost estimate criteria the options were ranked 1-5 (lowest to highest cost).

The scores for each criteria were multiplied by the weight to provide a grade score.

Results

The results of the MCA scores and weighting are set out in the table below and the options are ranked 1-5 (worst to best)

Option No.	Total Grade Score	Rank
1	2.6	2
2	Initially considered as a high level concept but was discounted due to not being feasible	
3	1.8	1
3a	2.8	3
4	3	4
5	3.5	5

Conclusion

Option 5 is the preferred option having the highest total grade score.

This option whilst the most expensive, provides a solution that has the greatest long term resilience and has a low potential impact on archaeology.

Attachments

Attachment	Title	Objective ID
A	Mauao base track options MCA spreadsheet	A8245243
B	Mauao Base Track Options Assessment Report (T+T)	A8084299
C	DC149 - Remediation of Mauao Base Track - Request for Funding - 28 June 2017	A2424315
C	DC149 - Appendix A and B - Council - 28 June 2017 - Remediation of Mauao Base Track	A2424314